FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

The Group of Responsables Aerodynamics (GoR AD) An Overview of activities and Success Stories

G. Mingione¹, J.L. Hantrais-Gervois², F. Monge³, H. van der Ven⁴, K. Richter⁵, M. Tormalm⁶, L. R. Calavera⁷, B. Stefes⁷, D. Pagan⁸, P. Eliasson⁹, M. Mallet¹⁰, R. Gemma¹¹

¹CIRA, ²ONERA, ³INTA, ⁴NLR, ⁵DLR, ⁶FOI, ⁷AIRBUS, ⁸MBDA, ⁹SAAB, ¹⁰DASSAULT, ¹¹LEONARDO



Our 50th Anniversary: Charting The Future!

FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

GARTEUR Story and Mission



For each area a Group of Responsible (GoR) is established with the objective to address and monitor activities (Exploratory Group and Action Group)

GROUP FOR AERONAUTICAL RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY IN EUROPE FRANCE ITALY THE NETHERLANDS GERMANY SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM **Aerodynamics GoR**

The Group is active in experimental, theoretical, analytical, as well as in numerical fields of aerodynamics to support the development of methods and procedures.

Work in experimental areas is performed mainly to obtain valuable data for the validation of methods. Measurement techniques are developed and refined to increase accuracy and efficiency of experimental investigations. Numerical studies and development of CFD codes are performed to give insight in the mechanisms of basic flow phenomena.

The GoR AD initiates and organizes basic and applied aerodynamic research in the field of aeronautics.



FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

Aerodynamics GoR

Topics:

- ✓ Aerodynamics
- ✓ Aero-thermodynamics
- ✓ Aero-acoustics
- ✓ Aero-(servo-)elasticity
- ✓ Aerodynamic shape optimization
- ✓ Aerodynamics coupled to flight mechanics
- ✓ Aircraft icing simulation
- ✓ Multidisciplinary design and analysis
- \checkmark Systems and propulsion aerodynamic integration

Both experimental and computational. Both civil and military.





FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

- ✓ GARTEUR along the time had a fundamental role in establishing cooperation among European company.
- ✓ When GARTEUR was set-up, in a period where collaborative projects funded from EU were far from arrive, GARTEUR represented a unique possibility of cooperation among European companies and research centres and represented the feed of future European funded collaborative projects.
 - ✓ The first GoR-AD action group is from 1979: AD/AG-01 wing body aerodynamics at transonic speed
 - ✓ At present time we have arrived at AD/AG-61 WMLES and Embedded LES.
 - ✓ Therefore this means that along its life GARTEUR-AD has developed 61 projects on several topics related to aerodynamics



FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM PERFORMED ACTION GROUP (1/2)

AD/AG-01 Wing-body aerodynamics at transonic speed

AD/AG-02 Two dimensional transonic testing methods

AD/AG-03 Theory/Experiment comparison for high lift airfoil (High lift phase I)

AD/AG-04 An experimental and theoretical investigation into the asymmetric vortex flows characteristics of bodies of revolution at high angles of

incidence in low speed flow

AD/AG-05 Convergence study for transonic flow for 3D wings

AD/AG-06 Model Support Interference in Large Low-Speed Wind Tunnels

AD/AG-07 Experimental investigation of the turbulent shear layers on swept wing

AD/AG-08 High lift action group (High lift phase I)

AD/AG-09 Flow past missiles afterbody

AD/AG-10 Flow computation for advanced propellers

AD/AG-11 Computations of 2D Navier-Stokes Equations

AD/AG-12 Comparative Investigation of Predictive Capability of Aeroacoustics Methods of Single Rotation Propellers

AD/AG-13 High lift phase III

AD/AG-14 Transition for Airfoils and Wings

AD/AG-15 Validation of Euler codes for supersonic flow (2 parts)

AD/AG-16 Development of Software Package for Graphic Visualization of Flow Simulation

AD/AG-17 Verification of 3D Transonic Euler Methods for Complex Geometries

AD/AG-18 Adaptive wall wind tunnels

AD/AG-19 Particle Image Velocimetry

AD/AG-21 Pressure Sensitive Paint

AD/AG-22 Practical Application of LDV

AD/AG-23 Three Dimensional Turbulent Shear Layer Experiment, Phase 2

AD/AG-24 Navier-Stokes calculations of the supersonic flow about slender configurations

AD/AG-25 Computational Methods for High Lift Flows (High lift phase IV)

AD/AG-26 Navier Stokes Computations of 3D Transonic Flow for a Wing/Fuselage Configuration

AD/AG-27 Transition on airfoils and infinite swept wings with regard to nonlocal instability investigations

AD/AG-28 Transonic Wing/Body Code Validation Experiment

AD/AG-29 Three-dimensional turbulent shear layer experiment - Phase 3

AD/AG-30 CFD for Supersonic Civil Transport high-lift evaluation and configuration development

AD/AG-31 Analysis of a Supersonic Transport Configuration with and without foreplan using a Navier Stokes solver

AD/AG-32 Prediction of performance degradation due to icing for 2D configurations

AD/AG-33 Ice accretion prediction on aircraft components



FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

PERFORMED ACTION GROUP (2/2)

AD/AG-34 Aerodynamics of supersonic air intakes

AD/AG-35 Application of Transition Criteria in Navier Stokes Computations

AD/AG-36 3D High Lift Computations

AD/AG-37 Pressure sensitive paint, Phase II

AD/AG-38 Time Accurate Methods

AD/AG-39 Transonic Wing/Body Calculations, Phase II

AD/AG-40 Ice shapes effects on the aerodynamic performance of airfoils, Phase II

AD/AG-41 Ice Accretion Prediction, Phase II

AD/AG-42 Navier-Stokes Calculations of the Transonic Flow Over Slender Configurations

AD/AG-43 Application of CFD to High Offset Intake Diffusers

AD/AG-44 Application of Transition Criteria in NS-Computations, Phase II

AD/AG-45 Application of CFD to predict high "G" loads

AD/AG-46 Highly Integrated Subsonic Air Intakes

AD/AG-47 Coupling of CFD with Flight Mechanics

AD/AG-48 Lateral Jet Interactions at Supersonic Speeds

AD/AG-49 Scrutinizing Hybrid RANS-LES Methods for Aerodynamic Applications

AD/AG-50 Effect of Wind Tunnel Shear Layers on Aero-acoustics Measurements

AD/AG-51 Transition and Turbulence in Hypersonic flows

AD/AG-52 Surrogate Modelling in Aeronautical Design and Optimization

AD/AG-53 Receptivity and Transition

AD/AG-54 RANS-LES Interfacing Hybrid for Hybrid RANS-LES and embedded LES approaches

AD/AG-55 Countermeasures Aerodynamics

AD/AG-56 Coupled fluid dynamics and Flight Mechanics

AD/AG-57 Secondary inlets and outlets for ventilation

AD/AG-58 Supersonic air intakes

AD/AG-59 Laminar separation bubbles

AD/AG-60 Machine learning and data-driven approaches for aerodynamic optimization and uncertainty quantification

AD/AG-61 WMLES and Embedded LES



FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

Examples of performed Action Groups



AD/AG-54 RANS-LES Interfacing Hybrid for Hybrid RANS-LES and embedded LES approaches



AD/AG-24 Navier-Stokes calculations of the supersonic flow about slender configurations

AD/AG-36 3D High Lift Computations

AD/AG-47 Coupling of CFD with

Flight Mechanics



AD/AG-46 Highly Integrated Subsonic Air Intakes



Our 50th Anniversary: Charting The Future!

FRANCE ITALY GERMANY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

Along this period several radical revolutions have happened in aerodynamics

- Development and availability of increasing CFD capabilities
- ✓ Design and optimization of transonic aircraft
- ✓ High lift improvements
- ✓ Studies on second generation high speed transportation
- ✓ Reduction of environmental impact

✓ Stealth requirements on aerodynamics design



FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

- ✓ The first one is of course the development of computer and, as consequence in parallel, the development of Computational Fluid Dynamics.
- ✓ In parallel with increase of computer resource more and more accurate tools for aerodynamics simulation have been developed.
 - ✓ Euler solver
 - ✓ RANS solver
 - ✓ Grid generation
 - \checkmark LES and hybrid methods
- ✓ It is not by chance that the first action group was dedicated to numerical/experimental comparison.



The first action groups were dedicated to CFD code development and validation



2D

- ✓ AD/AG-02 Two dimensional transonic testing methods
- ✓ AD/AG-03 Theory/Experiment comparison for high lift airfoil
- ✓ AD/AG-11 Computations of 2D Navier-Stokes Equations

- 3D
- ✓ AD/AG-23 Three Dimensional Turbulent Shear Layer Experiment Phase 2
- ✓ AD/AG-24 Navier-Stokes calculations of the supersonic flow about slender configurations
- ✓ AD/AG-25 Computational Methods for High Lift Flows
- ✓ AD/AG-26 Navier Stokes Computations of 3D Transonic Flow for a Wing/Fuselage Configuration



FRANCE ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SWEDEN **SPAIN** UNITED KINGDOM GERMANY

- ✓ Large efforts where dedicated to high lift:
- ✓ GARTEUR early activities on High Lift Aerodynamics were four Action Groups 1981-1998:
 - ✓ AD/AG-03 1981-1984 High lift, phase I
 - ✓ AD/AG-08 1985-1990 High lift, phase II
 - ✓ AD/AG-13 1991-1994 High lift, phase III
 - ✓ AD/AG-25 1995-1998 High lift, phase IV (maximum lift prediction)

High lift is still an open issue and more recently AD/AG-36 3D High Lift Computations was performed





FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

In the nineties there was a new interest in supersonic transport, and therefore this interest was caught by GARTEUR that addressed the topics.

- ✓ AD/AG-30 CFD for Supersonic Civil Transport high-lift evaluation and configuration development
- ✓ AD/AG-31 Analysis of a Supersonic Transport Configuration with and without foreplan using a Navier-Stokes solver

Interest on high speed transportation was replaced by interest on environmental impact, therefore, AG regarding fuel consumption reduction (laminarity) and noise have been addressed

- ✓ AD/AG-27 Transition on airfoils and infinite swept wings with regard to nonlocal instability investigations
- ✓ AD/AG-35 Application of Transition Criteria in Navier-Stokes Computations
- ✓ AD/AG-53 Receptivity and Transition
- ✓ AD/AG-12 Comparative Investigation of Predictive Capability of Aeroacoustics Methods of Single Rotation Propellers



FRANCE THE NETHERLANDS GERMANY ITALY SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

Flight safety has also been addressed with icing topics

- ✓ AD/AG-32 Prediction of performance degradation due to icing for 2D configurations configurations
- ✓ AD/AG-33 Ice accretion prediction on aircraft components
- \checkmark AD/AG-40 Ice shapes effects on the aerodynamic performance of airfoils, phase II
- ✓ AD/AG-41 Ice Accretion Prediction, Phase II

A large amount of work has been performed also for military aircraft problems

- ✓ AD/AG-09 Flow past missiles afterbody
- ✓ AD/AG-34 Aerodynamics of Supersonic Intakes
- ✓ AD/AG-46 Highly Integrated Subsonic Air Intakes
- ✓ AD/AG-48 Lateral Jet Interactions at Supersonic Speeds
- ✓ AD/AG-55 Countermeasures Aerodynamics





FRANCE SWEDEN ITALY THE NETHERLANDS GERMANY SPAIN UNITED KINGDOM

AG-55 Countermeasure aerodynamics

Countermeasures are used to decoy enemy tracking systems. Aerodynamics is crucial for the performance of countermeasures protecting air vehicles.

In this action group, prediction of trajectories for countermeasure objects is addressed.

Two commonly used countermeasures are chaff and flares, which are the main focus of this action group and that have been simulated by using CFD

Chaff is radar countermeasure consisting of small pieces or threads of metal or metalized glass fibre. \checkmark

Flares are used against IR-seeking missiles. They are a few decimetres in length and can have built in propulsions systems. \checkmark



Our 50th Anniversary: Charting The Future!

FRANCE ITALY SWEDEN THE NETHERLANDS GERMANY SPAIN UNITED KINGDOM

AG-56 Coupled fluid dynamics and flight mechanics simulation of very flexible aircraft configurations

The goals of AD/AG-56 are twofold: firstly, this endeavour aims to enhance each partner's capabilities in aeroelastic simulations pertaining to very flexible aircraft. A second aim is to derive a common test case in terms of aircraft and manoeuvre. This will allow the various partners to benchmark their solvers and tools.

This topic poses a challenge due to various requirements inherent to such analyses:

- ✓ A flight mechanics model for flexible structures,
- ✓ CFD methods with robust grid handling technique capable of modelling a combination of large rigid body motion and large flexible motion,
- ✓ Fluid-structure interaction procedures that are capable of modelling large translations and finite rotations.

Participants: NLR (coordinator), Airbus, DLR, CIRA, ONERA,



Airbus XRF-1 model



FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

AG-57 Secondary inlets and outlets for ventilation

Analyse the efficiency of a submerged NACA type air intake for multiple flight envelopes using state-of-the-art CFD and performance evaluation methods.

Analyse the feasibility of a low-observable secondary inlet integrated in the main air intake duct of a combat aircraft and assess the impact on the intake duct flow field and on engine/intake-compatibility.

Investigate different types of secondary inlets, shapes, locations, and sizes with respect to advantages regarding radar cross section and aerodynamic performance.



Participants: CIRA (coordinator), Airbus, DLR, NLR

FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

AG-58 Supersonic air intakes

The main objective for the AG-58 is to gather a database of relevant flow features for supersonic air intakes and validate CFD codes on these specific topics. Three test cases have been identified:

- A generic supersonic diffuser flow
- A supersonic Mach 3 ramjet air intake
- An hypersonic Mach 7.5 scramjet air intake

The project is expected to yield increased understanding of turbulence modelling issues for complex internal flows in supersonic and hypersonic intakes.







Our 50th Anniversary: Charting The Future!

GROUP FOR AERONAUTICAL RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY IN EUROPE

FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

AG-59 Improving the modelling of laminar separation bubbles

The main objective is to improve the modelling of the numerical methods used in the reproduction of the laminar separation bubbles and the consequent effects on flow instability.

The main issues to be addressed are:

- ✓ The determination of the transition location and of the transition region,
- ✓ The enhancement of the production of the turbulent kinetic energy in the separated flow inside the recirculation region,
- ✓ Evolution of the bubble with the incidence and with turbulence level,
- ✓ Possible burst of the bubble at high incidence and consequences on the stall characteristics,
- Critical evaluation of the laminar boundary-layer instability analysis methods treatment of laminar separation bubbles.





FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

AG-60 Machine learning and data-driven approaches for aerodynamic optimization and uncertainty quantification

Fluid dynamics has traditionally dealt with massive amounts of data from experiments, field measurements, and large-scale numerical simulations.

The purpose of the AG60 is to perform an extensive comparison of surrogate models and machine learning techniques for aerodynamic analysis and prediction. The action group consists of 11 partners, including eight research establishments (CIRA, NLR, INTA, DLR, FOI, ONERA, IRT and INRIA), two industrial partners (AIRBUS-Military, AIRBUS) and one SME (OPTIMAD).



FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

AG-61 WMLES and Embedded LES

The recent needs of the aerospace industry for design and certification processes have issued increasingly difficult challenges for the CFD community. This requires simulations of increased fidelity at an affordable computational cost. An attractive way is the **Hybrid RANS/LES Methods** "HRLM" aiming to treat the regions of interest with LES (Large Eddy Simulations) whereas the rest of the flow is modelled in RANS (Reynolds Averaged Navier-Stokes) approach at a low computational cost (LES is thus embedded).

The proposed activities will be conducted by means of extensive computations of the following four test cases that will serve the modelling validation and verification. <u>Partners</u>: ONERA (lead), FOI, CIRA, DLR, NLR, SAAB, UNIMAN, UNISTRA TC2: Shock Wave-Boundary Layer Interaction TC 3:





Gradient flat-plate boundary layer





FRANCE GERMANY ITALY THE NETHERLANDS SPAIN SWEDEN UNITED KINGDOM

EXPLORATORY GROUP

AD/EG-79 Hypersonic *flow* AD/EG-80 Morphing technologies AD/EG-81 Virtual certification AD/EG-82 Corner flows AD/EG-83 Hydrogen combustion



EG-79 Shock wave boundary layer interaction



EG-83 hydrogen combustion



Our 50th Anniversary: Charting The Future!